

Unpublished correspondence between Russell & Wittgenstein

by B.F. McGuinness and G.H. von Wright

TWO RECENT FINDS have encouraged us to plan a new edition of Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Letters to Russell, Keynes, and Moore* (Basil Blackwell, 1974) and meanwhile to make available to readers of *Russell* those parts of the finds that relate to the subject of their study. The first find (communicated to us by Dr. Kenneth Blackwell of the Bertrand Russell Archives) was that of three hitherto unknown letters from Wittgenstein to Russell, found among Dora Russell's papers and now in the Archives. The second find (which we learnt of through Dr. Walter Methlagl of the Brenner Archiv) was that of a large number of letters to Wittgenstein, including twenty-one letters from Russell. These evidently formed part of a collection retained by Wittgenstein, which later went astray. Credit for recognizing them in time to save them goes to Frau Charlotte Eder of Vienna while that for placing them in the Brenner Archiv belongs to Diplom-Ingenieur Otto Vest-Rusan, also of Vienna. The present writers are grateful to the Copyright Permissions Committee of the Bertrand Russell Archives, McMaster University, for permission to publish letters from Russell and to the owners of the Wittgenstein copyrights (in GHvW's case to his fellow-owners) for permission to publish those from Wittgenstein. One or two other relevant documents are also included in this publication.

For general background and for most of Wittgenstein's side of the correspondence, readers must be referred to the Wittgenstein *Letters* volume already mentioned, and to its notes, or to the volume: Ludwig Wittgenstein, *Briefe* (Suhrkamp, 1980, under our editorship). We quote other letters under the numbers there given, as R.*n* for the former, B.*m* for the latter. To introduce the material here, it may be said that it belongs to the period from 1915 to 1922, during which Wittgenstein was first a soldier in the Austro-Hungarian

army, then a prisoner of war in Italy, then at a Teachers' Training College in Vienna, then an elementary school teacher (so Russell, but in modern English terms a primary school teacher) in Lower Austria; while Russell was in London opposing the war or in prison for the way in which he opposed the war and, after it, variously engaged in visits to Russia and China, and in starting a family. In this post-war period Russell arranged for the publication of Wittgenstein's *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* and also met Wittgenstein twice, once at The Hague in 1919, once in Innsbruck in 1922. The Wittgenstein letter supplement what we already had, but this is the first view of Russell's side of the correspondence. Two of Russell's wartime letters were written in German evidently to render them more transparent to censorship. Wittgenstein at this period wrote to Russell nearly always in his own language. Translations (by BFMcG) are provided when required.

*Dipartimento di Filosofia e Scienze Sociali
Universita degli Studi di Siena*

*Department of Philosophy
University of Helsinki*

1. BR to LW

Trinity College
Cambridge
5 Feb. 1911

MY DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

It was a *very* great happiness to hear from you—I had been thinking of you constantly and longing for news. I am amazed that you have been able to write a MS. on logic since the war began. I cannot tell you how great a joy it will be to see you again after the war, if all goes well. If only your MSS come to me, I will do my utmost to understand them and make others understand them; but without your help it will be difficult.

Your letter came about 3 weeks ago—I did not know how I should answer it, but I am enabled to by the kindness of an American who is going to Italy

Please remember me to your mother, and tell her that you are constantly in my mind with anxious affection.

Ever yours

BERTRAND RUSSELL

This letter is not part of the Austrian find, but came to the Russell Archives from W.H. Watson, the physicist. Though sent by Russell it was returned (see 2.) and was only given to Wittgenstein after the war. In the 1930s Wittgenstein made a present of it to W.H. Watson, a Cambridge friend.

to hear from you—Russell is referring to Wittgenstein's letter (R.30; B.61) apparent of December 1914.

2. BR to LW

Trinity College,
Cambridge.
10.V.15

LIEBER WITTGENSTEIN!

Dein Brief vom 13^{ten} April ist eben jetzt angekommen—ich freue mich sehr Nachrichten von Dir zu bekommen. Als ich Deinen vorigen Brief erhielt, habe ich sofort geantwortet, zur selben Zeit als ich Deiner Mutter schrieb, aber der Brief ist nach zwei Monaten zurückgekommen—er soll zu freundlich gewesen sein! Von Deiner Mutter habe ich neulich einen sehr lieben Brief bekommen—bitte schicke ihr meinen besten Dank dafür.

Wenn Du dafür die Zeit hast, so solltest Du in Krakau einen einsamen alten Logiker besuchen, Namens M. Dziewicki, Szczepanska, 11. Er hat die "Principia Mathematica" studiert, und kennt wahrscheinlich niemand der sich mit der modernen Logik beschäftigt. Es würde ihm gewiß große Freude machen, Dich zu sehen.

Ich habe alles von Moore erhalten, was er über Tautologien etc. zu berichten hatte; es war mir aber nur in geringem Maaße verständlich. Ich hoffe aus ganzem Herzen daß Du mir nach dem Kriege alles mündlich erklären wirst. Seit der Krieg anfang, ist es mir unmöglich über Philosophie zu denken—daran wird aber wohl schließlich ein Ende sein. Ich denke fortwährend an Dich, und sende Dir die herzlichsten Wünsche.

Dein

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

[Translation:

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN,

Your letter of 13 April has just arrived—I am very happy to have news from you. When I received your earlier letter, I replied at once, at the same time as I wrote to your mother. But the letter came back two months later: it seems to have been too friendly! I have recently had a very kind letter from your mother—please send her my best thanks for it.

In Cracow, if you have the time for it, you should visit a lonely old logician called M. Dziewicki, Szczepanska, 11. He has studied *Principia Mathematica* and probably knows no one who has concerned himself with modern logic. It would certainly give him great pleasure to see you.

I have got from Moore everything he had to report about tautologies etc., but it was intelligible to me only in very small measure. I hope with all my heart that you will explain everything to me orally after the war. Since the war

began, it has been impossible for me to think about philosophy—but no doubt that will come to an end some day. I think of you continually and send you most heartfelt wishes.

Yours

BERTRAND RUSSELL.]

Dein Brief vom 13^{ten} April/your letter of 13 April. – This appears to be lost.

Dziewicki – M.H. Dziewicki, who among other things taught English in Cracow, had published a paper on scholastic philosophy in the *Proceedings of the Aristotelian Society*. He was in philosophical correspondence with Russell during this period. Two postcards from Dziewicki to Wittgenstein (now in the Brenner Archiv) show that there were visits to Dziewicki's house by Wittgenstein in (apparently) June 1915 and philosophical discussions (e.g. of the problem of the contiguity of instants of time). After the war Dziewicki wrote to Russell (the letters are in the Russell Archives):

I am glad to get news of Wittgenstein; a most genial young man, whom I was very much pleased to meet. Will you tell him how much I rejoice to know that his gloomy forebodings have not been realized.

Internal evidence suggests that “a young man of genius” is meant. Against the last quoted sentence is a note in Russell's hand: “He expected to be killed in Russia.” In further letters Dziewicki requests a copy of *Tractatus Logico-Philosophicus* and later comments on the work, saying *inter alia* that its doctrine that belief is not a relation had been one of the main points of difference between him and Wittgenstein in their discussions.

3. BR to LW

34 Russell Chambers
Bury Str. W.C.
25 Nov. 1915

LIEBER WITTGENSTEIN!

Es war mir eine sehr große Freude Deinen lieben Brief zu erhalten—erst vor einigen Tagen ist er angekommen. Es freut mich ganz außerordentlich daß Du eine Abhandlung schreibst die Du veröffentlichen willst. Ich glaube kaum daß es notwendig sei bis zum Ende des Krieges zu warten. Könntest Du nicht das MS. vervielfältigen lassen und nach Amerika schicken? Professor Ralph Barton Perry, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., U.S.A., kennt Deine früheren logischen Theorien durch mich. Er würde mir das MS. schicken, und ich würde es veröffentlichen.

Seit langer Zeit habe ich weder Pinsent noch Johnson gesehen. Ich bin während diesem Winter nicht in Cambridge. Nächstes Frühjahr kehre ich zurück.

Wie schön wird es sein wenn wir uns endlich wiedersehen! Ich denke fortwährend an Dich, und wünsche Nachrichten von Dir zu bekommen. Sei glücklich, und möge der Schicksal Dich schonen!

Dein treuer

BERTRAND RUSSELL

[Translation:

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN,

It was a very great pleasure for me to receive your kind letter—it arrived only a few days ago. I am absolutely delighted that you are writing a monograph and want it published. I hardly think that it is necessary to wait until the end of the war. Could you not have a copy of the manuscript made and send it to America? Professor Ralph Barton Perry, Harvard University, Cambridge, Mass., U.S.A., knows of your previous logical theories from me. He would send me the manuscript and I would publish it.

It is a long time since I have seen either Pinsent or Johnson. This winter I am not in Cambridge. I go back there next spring.

How splendid it will be when we finally meet again. I constantly think of you and want to have news of you. Be happy, and may Fate spare you!

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL]

Deinen ... Brief/your ... letter. – R.31; B.70 of 22 May 1915, where Wittgenstein speaks of a manuscript written during the war, which (if he dies) must be published whether anyone understands it or not.

Perry. – An eminent philosopher at Harvard, where Russell in 1914 explained Wittgenstein's ideas, using a version of *Notes on Logic*.

Pinsent, Johnson. – Cambridge friends: David Pinsent (Wittgenstein's closest friend) was killed in the war and the *Tractatus* is dedicated to his memory. W.E. Johnson, fellow of King's, was meant to supervise Wittgenstein's work but the friendship of the two was not in fact of a philosophical nature.

4. BR to LW

Garsington Manor,
near Oxford.

2.3.19

Most thankful to hear you are still alive. Please write on Logic, when possible. I hope it will not be long now before a talk will be possible. I too have very much to say about philosophy etc.

B. RUSSELL.

This and the following item are postcards sent by Russell from Lady Ottoline Morrell's house after receiving from Wittgenstein word that he was alive and in a prisoner of war camp in Cassino, Italy (R.33; B.94). In 6. below Russell explains that he thought *letters* were not allowed.

5. *BR to LW*

Manor House,
Garsington, Oxford.

3.3.19.

Very glad to hear from you—had been anxious for a long time. I shall be most interested to learn what you have done in Logic. I hope before long it may be possible to hear all about it. Shall be glad of further news—about your health etc.

B. RUSSELL.

A duplicate of 4. above, no doubt occasioned by distrust of postal connections with a prisoner-of-war camp. In fact both postcards are postmarked 8 March on arrival in Cassino.

6. *BR to LW*

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S. W.

21 June 1919

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

Your letter reached me today, but your MS. has not come yet. It is true that what you dictated to Moore was not intelligible to me, and he would give me no help. I think probably it is true that I shan't understand your MS till I see you, but it will be easier to get understanding from your talk if I have read the MS carefully first. At the moment, I could not get a passport to go abroad, but that won't last. I think probably it will be possible for us to meet at Christmas time, but it is not likely to be possible sooner.

I wrote only two post-cards, as I thought letters would not be allowed. But I wrote innumerable letters about you, trying to get greater freedom for you. They bore some slight fruit, but not as much as I hoped. I also wrote to your mother, but the letter was returned to me!—Please don't be discouraged about my understanding your work. Throughout the war I did not think about philosophy, until, last summer, I found myself in prison, and beguiled my leisure by writing a popular text-book, which was all I could do under the circumstances. Now I am back at philosophy, and more in the mood to understand.

I shall read your MS the moment I get it, and return it. What will be the

address to which it is to be returned? All friendship and affection from me to you. Don't be discouraged—you will be understood in the end.

Yours ever

B. RUSSELL.

Your letter. — That of 12 June (R.36; B.99) is evidently meant. Possibly an answer by Russell to Wittgenstein's letter of 13 March has been lost.

innumerable letters. — See editors' note to Wittgenstein's letters from Cassino of 13 March and 12 June (R.35, 36; B.96, 99).

popular text-book. — *Introduction to Mathematical Philosophy*, the only book which Russell wrote during his time in prison, must be the text-book in question.

MS. has not come yet. — Wittgenstein in the letter referred to (R.36; B.99) had announced that he was sending Russell the manuscript of his book, through Keynes's intermediacy.

7. *BR to LW*

70, Overstrand Mansions
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S. W.
13 August 1919

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I have now read your book twice carefully.—There are still points I don't understand—some of them important ones—I send you some queries on separate sheets. I am convinced you are right in your main contention, that logical props are tautologies, which are not true in the sense that substantial props are true. I do not understand why you are content with a purely ordinal theory of number, nor why you use for the purpose an ancestral relation, when you object to ancestral relations. This part of your work I want further explained. Also you do not state your reasons against classes. *I am sure you are right in thinking the book of first-class importance.* But in places it is obscure through brevity. I have a most intense desire to see you, to talk it over, as well as simply because I want to see you. But I can't get abroad as yet. Probably you will be free to come to England before I am free to go abroad.—I will send back your MS when I know where to send it, but I am hoping you will soon be at liberty.

All best wishes. Do write again soon.

Yours ever,

B. RUSSELL.

[The separate sheet with queries:]

*Wittgenstein*2. What is the difference between *Tatsache* and *Sachverhalt*?

[The separate sheet with queries:]

Wittgenstein

2. What is the difference between Tatsache and Sachverhalt?
3. “Das logische Bild der Tatsachen ist der Gedanke.” Yes, I agree. But a Gedanke is a Tatsache: what are its constituents and components, and what is their relation to those of the pictured Tatsache?
- 3.331. The theory of types, in my view, is a theory of correct symbolism: (a) a simple symbol must not be used to express anything complex; (b) more generally, a symbol must have the same structure as its meaning.
- 4 & 4.001. “Der Gedanke ist der sinnvolle Satz.” “Die Gesamtheit der Sätze ist die Sprache.” Does a Gedanke consist of words? Compare 3 (above).
- 4.112. I agree strongly with this number.
- 4.1272. I suppose this hangs together with the rejection of identity. It is awkward to be unable to speak of Nc^{\vee} . One could still say

$$\text{or} \quad \begin{array}{l} (\exists \phi) \cdot Nc^{\vee} \mathcal{A}(\phi x) > V \\ (\phi) \cdot Nc^{\vee} \mathcal{A}(\phi x) \leq V \end{array}$$

and I should have thought that from such props one could obtain a meaning for “there are at least 2 Gegenstände”—for you, “ $(\exists x, y, \phi) \cdot \phi x \cdot \phi y$ ” would suffice—and similar statements. There are things that puzzle me in this number and the next.

- 4.211. I gather no elementary prop is negative.
- 4.51. It is necessary also to be given the prop that *all* elementary props are given.
- 5.15. This theory of probability seems to me right.
- 5.3 All props results of truth-operations on elementary props? How about generality?
- 5.453. No numbers in logic? Why?
- 5.53 seq. On identity. I agree with this. But the connection with the axiom of infinity seems dubious. See remark on 4.1272 above.
6. “General truth-function: $[\bar{p}, \bar{\xi}, N(\bar{\xi})]$ ”
Yes, this is *one* way. But could one not do equally well by making $N(\bar{\xi})$ mean “at least one value of ξ is false”, just as one can do equally well with $\sim p \vee \sim q$ and with $\sim p \cdot \sim q$ as fundamental? I feel as if the duality of generality and existence persisted covertly in your system.
- 6.03. “General form of integer: $[0, \xi, \xi+1]$ ”. You only get finite ordinals. You deny classes, so cardinals collapse. What happens to \aleph_0 ? If you said classes were superfluous in *logic* I would imagine that I understood you, by supposing a distinction between logic and mathematics; but when you say they are unnecessary in *mathematics* I am puzzled. E.g. *something* true is expressed by $Nc^{\vee} C^{\vee} \alpha = 2^{Nc^{\vee} \alpha}$. How do you re-state this prop?

I agree with what you say about induction, causality, etc.; at least, I can find no ground for disagreeing.

8. BR to LW

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S. W.
8.9.19

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

Thank you for your letter and explanations, which have helped me a great deal. I am re-reading your book, and will return it as soon as I can do so safely, with remarks. I am very very much impressed by it, though whether it is definitive I don't yet feel sure.

This letter is only about meeting. The only plan that I can see is to try to meet at The Hague at Christmas time—it is doubtful whether I can get leave, for, as you may know, I have fallen out with the Government—but I will do all I possibly can to get permission. I can't come sooner as I have lectures to give, and getting permission will take a long time. Please let me know whether you would probably be able to come to Holland at Christmas or soon after—I could manage a week, if the government will let me go.

I will write later about your book. I hope you are at liberty now and back in Austria—Has the war injured you in any way?

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

your letter. – That of 19 August (R.37; B.100). Wittgenstein's letter of 30 August from Vienna and freedom (R.38; B.102) had clearly not yet arrived.

9. BR to LW

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S.W.
12.9.19.

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I have written to your publisher, praising your book in the highest terms. I hope the letter will reach him.—I wrote to you a few days ago, to your old address, saying that if I can obtain permission I will come to Holland at Christmas for a week to see you—I can't manage sooner or longer, worse luck. I am very thankful you are free—let me have personal news of your health, experiences etc. as soon as it is possible. Warmest good wishes.

Yours ever

B. RUSSELL

your publisher. – Braumüller. In a letter of 30 August 1919 (R.38; B.102) Wittgenstein had asked Russell to write an assessment of the book as required by this publisher.

10. BR to LW

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S.W.

14.10.19

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN—

Thanks for your letter, which arrived today. I will send back your book in a few days: I was waiting to know which address to send it to. I have not written things in the blank pages, except once or twice, because talk will be much better. I studied the book rather carefully, and I think now I do fairly understand it. But we shall see. I shall send it to your new address.

It is terrible to think of your having to earn your living, but I am not surprised by your action. I am much poorer too. They say Holland is very expensive but I suppose we can endure a week of it without going bankrupt. I find the time that would suit me best would be before Christmas, about Dec. 13–20—I ought to be back in England for Christmas. I will see about getting permission, and shall assume that date. It may turn out that Switzerland would be better.—Tell your publisher from me that he is a low scoundrel! My dear Wittgenstein it will be a joy to see you again after all these years—In all friendship,

Yours ever,
BERTRAND RUSSELL.

An answer to Wittgenstein's letter of 6 October 1919 (R.39; B.105).

I have not written ... except once or twice. – This is true of the Engelmann typescript (TS 202), now in the Bodleian Library, Oxford.

your action. – Wittgenstein had given away all his money.

11. BR to LW

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S. W.

13.11.19

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN—

Your MS. has been posted to the address you gave in your last letter—it was posted only two days ago, as there were a number of difficulties at the Post Office. I am looking forward to seeing you more than I can say. It is of

course *possible* that I may be refused a passport—if so I will let you know at once.

The furniture-dealers you mention must be B. Jolley & Son, Bridge Str., Camb. I have written to them saying I have your authority to have your things sold, but I think you should write to them also, otherwise they may refuse to accept my authority. If the sale is not yet completed when I come to Holland, I can give you in advance whatever the furniture, books etc. are judged to be worth. They ought easily to pay your expenses.

In all friendship and affection,

Your

B. RUSSELL.

In his letter of 1 November 1919 (R.40; B.108) Wittgenstein had asked Russell to sell the possessions he had left in store in Cambridge and to bring the proceeds to Holland.

write to them also. – No letter from Wittgenstein to the dealers is known. See also Wittgenstein to Russell, 27 November 1919 (R.42; B.112).

judged to be worth. – The dealers valued the furniture at £80. See 12.

12. BR to LW

70 Overstrand Mansions
Battersea S.W.

24 Nov. '19

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN—

I have got my passport but find great difficulties over the Dutch visa, as I dare say you do too. It seems not impossible that we may not be both able to get visas. If I fail, I will wire to you the one word “impossible”. In that case, we shall have to wait till Easter, and then meet in Switzerland. I shall be *very* sorry if that happens. But I find (what I didn't know) that Switzerland is much easier to get to than Holland.—Jolley, at Cambridge, offers £80 for your furniture, not including the books. If I go back to Cambridge, which I may do, I should probably be glad to take your furniture, or part of it. Would it suit you if I paid you £100 for the furniture and books (not including any special books that you might want returned[]) and then I could arrange with Jolley what I wanted to keep. I don't know whether it is legally possible to pay you yet, but I will find out. You would have to write to

B. Jolley & Son, Bridge Str. Camb.

to say you had sold the furniture and books to me and they were to deal with me.

Please let me know as soon as you possibly can whether you can get your visa. It will be a very great disappointment if we have to put off meeting till the spring.

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

13. *BR to LW*

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S. W.

27.II.19

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I have my passport and visa; I informed the authorities that my business was to see you. I suggest your arriving *Dec. 11*, as I am not quite sure what day I shall get away. I will buy your furniture from you, which will pay your expenses. I don't know where I shall stay, but will have a letter at *Poste Restante* addressed to you, to say where I am staying, if you arrive after me. If you arrive first, you can do the same. I can't tell you how much I look forward to seeing you—you have been in my thoughts so much all through this long time.

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

letter at Poste Restante. – See the two notes from Russell, below.

14. *BR to LW*

Hotel Twee Steeden
(Hotel des deux Villes)
Buitenhof

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

This is my address. I have got here without misadventure and I hope you will. Come on here straight the moment you arrive. It *will* be joy to see you again.

Yours ever

B.R.

15. *BR to LW*

Hotel Twee Steden
(= des deux Villes)
Buitenhof, Den Haag

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

This is my address—Come here as quick as you can after your arrival in

The Hague—I am impatient to see you—We will find some way to get your book published—in England if necessary.

Yours ever

B.R.

my address. – Russell presumably left one of the two messages at the *Poste Restante* and the other, as requested in Wittgenstein's letter of 27 November 1919 (R.42; B.112), at the Austrian Embassy.

16. *BR to LW*

70, Overstrand Mansions,
Prince of Wales Road,
Battersea, S.W.
February 2nd, 1920.

Herr Ludwig Wittgenstein
Wien, XIII St. Veitgasse 17.

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN,

I have broken my collarbone and am therefore obliged to dictate this letter.

I am very glad to hear that Reclam will probably take your book. I waited to begin writing the introduction until I knew you had a publisher, since the introduction would have had to be quite different if it had been written for publication in England. I will get it done as soon as I possibly can, but I do not think it can be finished for another six weeks. You may, however, absolutely count upon it, and tell your publishers so.

I am very sorry to hear you have been ill.

I do not go back to Cambridge until October.

Keynes, as you may have heard, has written a book of the very greatest importance on the economic consequences of the peace. It is having a great effect upon opinion here, and is likely to do much good.

I loved our time together at the Hague, and was very happy, both in seeing you and in our discussions.

Yours ever,

BERTRAND RUSSELL

An answer to Wittgenstein's letters of 8 and 19 January (R.43, 44; B.119, 122). The former mentions that Wittgenstein was ill, the latter that he hoped Reclam would take his book.

another six weeks. – The Introduction was sent in the middle of March. See the next letter.

17. *BR to LW*

70 Overstrand Mansions
 Prince of Wales Road
 Battersea
 London, S.W.
 March 19th, 1920.

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN,

I am sending you at last the introduction which I promised you three months ago. I am sorry to have been so long about it, but breaking my collarbone made me stupid. I am assuming that you will translate it into German. When I have put in brackets “quote number so-and-so”, I have meant that it seemed an appropriate place to insert your actual words in the passages referred to. I did not think it worth while to translate your words into English and have you translate them back into German. If there is anything unsatisfactory to you in my remarks, let me know, and I will try to amend it.

How are you? I should like news of you.

Yours affectionately,
 BERTRAND RUSSELL.

18. *BR to LW*

70, Overstrand Mansions,
 Prince of Wales Road,
 Battersea, S. W.
 1.7.20

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I returned yesterday from Russia (where there are no posts) and found your letter waiting for me. I don't care twopence about the introduction but I shall be really sorry if your book isn't printed. May I try, in that case, to have it printed in England or America?

I have 2 months' letters to answer so I mustn't write more. Best love, now and always.

Yrs aff.
 B.R.

your letter. – That of 6 May (R.47; B.139) announcing that Wittgenstein was not satisfied with Russell's Introduction and had indicated as much to Reclam, who, consequently, would probably not take the book.

Russia. – Russell visited Russia in May and June 1920 as an unofficial member of a Labour Party Delegation.

19. *BR to LW*

Government University,
 Peking
 11.2.1921

MY DEAR WITTGENSTEIN—

I have been meaning to write you, ever since I got your letter of Sep. 20, which it gave me real happiness to get. I wonder how you like being an elementary school-teacher and how you get on with the boys. It is honest work, perhaps as honest as there is, and everybody now-a-days is engaged in some form of humbug, which you escape from.

I like China and the Chinese—they are lazy, good-natured, fond of laughter, very like nice children—they are very kind and nice to me. All the nations set upon them and say they mustn't be allowed to enjoy life in their own way—They will be forced to develop an army and navy, to dig up their coal and smelt their iron, whereas what they want to do is to make verses and paint pictures (very beautiful) and make strange music, exquisite but almost inaudible, on many-stringed instruments with green tassels. Miss Black and I live in a Chinese house, built around a courtyard; I send you a picture of me at the door of my study. My students are all Bolsheviks, because that is the fashion; they are annoyed with me for not being more of a Bolshevik myself. They are not advanced enough for mathematical logic. I lecture to them on Psychology, Philosophy, Politics and Einstein. Once in a way I have them to an evening party and they let off fire-works in the courtyard—they like this better than lectures.—I leave China in July, spend a month in Japan, and then come back to London—70 Overstrand Mansions, S.W. 11, will always find me.

Miss Black sends all sorts of messages. Best love, my dear Ludwig—I shall hope to see you again, perhaps next year. I suppose by then it will be possible to travel to Trattenbach. Be as happy as you can!

Ever yours affectionately
 BERTRAND RUSSELL.

your letter of Sept. 20. – R.51; B.138 from Wittgenstein's first teaching post, at Trattenbach in Lower Austria.

Miss Black. – Dora Black, who had been at The Hague with Russell and whom Russell married after their return from the journey to China. See 21.

20. *BR to LW*

Government University
 Peking,
 3 June 1921

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

Your letter of the 2nd April reached me yesterday.

Your manuscript is quite safe. I left it in England in the hopes of getting it printed, I do not know with what success. It is in the hands of Miss Wrinch of Girton, who is a good mathematician and a student of mathematical logic.

I am sorry you find the people in your neighbourhood so disagreeable. I don't think average human nature is up to much anywhere, and I dare say wherever you were you would find your neighbours equally obnoxious.

I have been in bed for the last ten weeks with a severe illness, but am now nearly well, and am returning to England this summer, so address there if you write again.

I am determined to get your manuscript published, and if it has not been achieved during my absence, I will take the matter in hand as soon as I return.

I wish you could come to England some time and pay me a visit, but I suppose that would be very difficult for you. I shall have to come to Trattenbach which, from the picture, looks quite a pretty place.

Best love, my dear Wittgenstein

Yours ever,

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

letter of the 2nd April. – This letter is lost. It evidently enclosed a picture postcard of Trattenbach.

Miss Wrinch. – On her share in the publication history of the *Tractatus*, see the next letter.

21. *BR to LW*

(Permanent Address)

31 Sydney Street

London S.W. 3

5.II.21

MY DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I was very glad to hear from you. First, I have to tell you about your MS. As you know, I left it to Miss Wrinch to deal with while I was in China. After various failures, she got it accepted by Ostwald for his *Annalen der Naturphilosophie*; the proofs have just come, and I suppose it will be published in about 2 months. I had thought she was only going to try English publishers, so I left her my introduction, which Ostwald is also printing. I am sorry, as I am afraid you won't like that, but as you will see from his letter, it can't be helped. It is also going to appear in English in a new philosophical library published by Kegan Paul, but probably that won't be for nearly a year. In English it will appear as a separate book. This is due to Ogden (of the Cambridge Mag.) who has taken a lot of trouble about it.

As for me, I am now married to Miss Black, and expecting a child in a few days. We have bought this house, and got your furniture from Cambridge,

which we like *very* much. The child will probably be born in your bed. There were a great many books of yours, as well as various boxes and parcels from engineering firms which you had never opened. If ever you come to see us, I will give you back any of your books that you may want. Your things are worth much more than I paid for them, and I will pay you more whenever you like. I didn't know when I bought them how much I was getting. In particular, if you could ever manage to come to England, you must let me pay the expenses of your journey as further payment for your furniture. I do wish you would come—the prospective child will make it a little more difficult for me to travel. I am quite well again now. I forget whether I told you that in Peking I was in the German hospital, and looked after by German Doctors. They were wonderfully skilled and kind and careful, and one of them, Dr. Esser, became a great friend of us both. I also made friends with an Austrian named Brandauer, who knew you by name. He had been a prisoner in Siberia.

I am very sorry you find the people of Trattenbach so trying. But I refuse to believe they are worse than the rest of the human race; my logical instinct revolts against the notion.

Do consider seriously coming to see us whenever you have long enough holidays. Best love, as always.

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

22. *BR to LW*

31 Sydney Str.

London S.W.3

24.II.21

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

Thanks for your letter. Ostwald had already printed before I saw the proofs—I think it must be out by now. Ogden has done all the business, and is going ahead with getting your work published in English. The publication is all arranged for. The publisher will be Kegan Paul. The translation is being done by two young men at Cambridge who know mathematical logic, and I am telling them all that you and I agreed on as regards translations of terms. What I saw of Ostwald's stuff was all right, and not in his "insane" orthography. In the English publication, we are trying to get the German text also printed, but I am not sure whether the publisher will agree.

Our boy was born on Nov. 16, and flourishes. He is called John Conrad (the latter after the novelist of that name, who is a friend of mine). My wife is now quite recovered and we are both very happy.

I am very sorry to hear you are not well. Remember that we shall both be overjoyed if you can ever come to see us, and that it will be easy to pay all your expenses by selling a few of your things which are of no use to me. Your

property was worth much more than Jolley pretended. Your books alone were worth £100, and I don't see why I should swindle you because Jolley understated the value of your things. £300 would have been a fair price. I will send you the extra £200 if you will accept it, or give you back anything of yours that you want when you come, whichever you prefer.

Best wishes for the New Year, and much love.

Yrs ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL

two young men. – One was F.P. Ramsey. Who the other was we have not been able to find out. Perhaps Russell wrongly supposed that R.B. Braithwaite (who in fact knew little German at that time) was going to assist with the translation.

While C.K. Ogden, who always speaks of “translators” in the plural, clearly took many of the final decisions and discussed them with Wittgenstein, it is probably inaccurate to refer to him as the translator of the work. It has, of course, long been clear, and these new letters of Russell's make it additionally so, that Ogden deserves great credit for ensuring its publication.

Jolley understated the value. – Wittgenstein's reaction to the offers made by Russell is unknown. But see the next letter about Wittgenstein's willingness to let Russell pay for his expenses in connection with a planned meeting.

23. BR to LW

31 Sydney Street S.W.3

7.2.22

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I was very glad to get your letter the other day, with your nice message to the little boy, which, as you suggested, I conveyed by appropriate symbols other than words. He flourishes, and gives us both great happiness.

I wonder you haven't heard from Ostwald. Have you written to him to tell him your address? If not, I don't suppose he knows it. I have heard nothing further about publication of your book, either here or in Germany, but I will find out next time I see Ogden.

We intend to go to Germany and Switzerland next August. If you have holidays then, I hope we could see you then—it would be easier for you, I suppose, than coming to England. In Switzerland we intend to stay with my brother's wife, who used to be Gräfin Arnim. I am sure she would be delighted to have you too, if you could come. I am *very* glad you will let me pay your expenses. If you *can* come to England sooner, do.

I liked China much better than Europe—the people are more civilized—I keep wishing I were back there. I lectured to them on all sorts of topics, but what they liked best was mathematical logic.

I wish you didn't have to work so hard at elementary teaching—it must be

24. Wittgenstein's letter in response to Russell's of 7 February 1922. Found among the papers of Dora Russell in 1985.

very dreary. Would you like me to bring your journals and note-books when we next meet? Take care of yourself—With love,

Yours ever

BERTRAND RUSSELL.

your letter. — This letter, evidently, is lost.

your journals and note-books. — See Wittgenstein's letter to Russell, 1 November 1919 (R40; B108). For Wittgenstein's reaction to Russell's question, see the next letter.

24. *LW to BR*

[1922]

LIEBER RUSSELL,

Dank' Dir für Dienen lieben Brief! Nein, von Ostwald habe ich noch nichts gehört. Ich dachte übrigens er wußte meine Adresse durch den der ihm meines Manuskript geschickt hat. Nun, das ist übrigens ganz gleichgültig wenn er die Geschichte nur überhaupt druckt und nicht zu viele Druckfehler hinein macht.

Ich bin in der letzten Zeit auch sehr niedergeschlagen. Nicht, daß mir das Lehren an der Volksschule zuwider ist. Im Gegenteil! Aber SCHWER ist es, daß ich in diesem Lande Lehrer sein muß, wo die Menschen so ganz und gar hoffnungslos sind. Ich habe in diesem Ort nicht eine Seele mit der ich ein wirklich vernünftiges Wort sprechen könnte. Wie ich das auf die Dauer aushalten werde weiß Gott! Ich glaub' Dir's gern daß auch Du es in China schöner gefunden hast als in England obwohl es in England zweifellos noch tausendmal besser ist als bei uns.—Du weißt wie ich mich freuen würde Dich zu sehen. Wenn mich die Frau Deines Bruders aufnimmt komme ich mit Freuden zu Euch. Meine Tagebücher und Notizen verwende, bitte, zum einheizen. Wenn Du täglich 2–3 Blätter zum Feueranzünden benützt werden sie bald aufgebraucht sein und ich hoffe sie werden gut brennen. Also—weg damit!—Bitte empfehl mich Deiner Frau und grüß den kleinen Buben. Und schreibe wieder einmal

Dienem

L. WITTGENSTEIN

P.S. Hast Du zufällig unter Deinen Büchern die "religiösen Streitschriften" von Lessing? Wenn ja so lies sie bitte! Ich glaube sie werden Dich interessieren und Dir gefallen. Ich liebe sie sehr! Dein L.W.

[Translation:

DEAR RUSSELL,

Thank you for your kind letter. No, I have not yet heard anything from Ostwald, though I did think he knew my address from the person who sent him my manuscript. But, anyway, that is completely unimportant, just as long

as he really prints the thing and does not introduce too many misprints.

I have been very depressed in recent times too. Not that I find teaching in the elementary school distasteful: quite the contrary. But what's HARD is that I have to be a teacher in this country where people are so completely and utterly hopeless. In this place I have not a single soul with whom I could talk in a really sensible way. How I shall support that in the long run, God knows! I readily believe that you too found things better in China than in England, though England still is without a doubt a thousand times better than here where I am.—

You know how happy I should be to see you. If your brother's wife will have me I will gladly come to see you all. Please use my journals and note-books for kindling. If you take 2 or 3 pages a day to light the fire, they will soon be used up, and I hope they burn well. Away with them, I say! Please remember me to your wife and give my greetings to the little boy. And write another letter to

Your

L. WITTGENSTEIN

P.S. Do you happen to have among your books the "Religious Controversies" of Lessing? If so, please read them. I think they will interest you and give you pleasure. I like them very much. Yours L.W.]

This is Wittgenstein's reply to 23. It is undated.

Tagebücher und Notizen / journals and notebooks. — We must assume that Russell complied with Wittgenstein's wish and destroyed this material.

25. *BR to LW*

Till July 25:

Sunny Bank, Treen, Penzance

31 Sydney Street

London S.W.3

9.5.22

DEAR WITTGENSTEIN

I have heard from my brother's wife, and she will be delighted if you will come to her Chalet in Switzerland when we are there—about 8th to 20th of August, but I will let you know the exact date later—certainly 15th ±ε. The address of her chalet is

Chalet Soleil, Randogne sur Sierre.

I have never been there, but I think it is above the Simplon railway, by a funicular. It will be a great happiness to see you again. My sister-in-law writes novels—they used to be all about Germany—"Elizabeth and her German garden" was the first. She used to live in Pommern. She has quarrelled with my brother, who is difficult as a husband.

Ogden is getting on with your book, which I gather he will print both in English and German. I suppose it will be out in October. I have never read Lessing's "religiöse Streitschriften"—I think they are among your books which I have in town—I will look when I get home. I am sorry you have such a depressing life. All Europe is horrible since the war, but I suppose it is worse in Austria than here. One gathers that England, Germany and Russia jointly are going to fight France—so it goes on.

The little boy is lovely—At first he looked exactly like Kant, but now he looks more like a baby—Best wishes from my wife. With love,

Yours ever
BERTRAND RUSSELL.

my brother's wife. – A letter of May 1922 to Russell from his sister-in-law is preserved which begins "I shall love to have Wittgenstein at the chalet". As far as known Wittgenstein's visit to Switzerland did not come off. In August 1922, however, Russell and Wittgenstein met in Innsbruck. There is a photograph from that occasion, probably taken by Dora Russell, showing Wittgenstein and Russell sitting opposite one another at a table. These documents are now in the Bertrand Russell Archives, McMaster University.

26. *LW to BR*
[November or December 1922]

LIEBER RUSSELL!

Schon lange habe ich von Dir nichts mehr gehört und Dir nicht mehr geschrieben, und heute schreibe ich Dir hauptsächlich, weil ich ein Anliegen an Dich habe: Ich will Dich, wie man bei uns sagt "anpumpen". Wie Du weißt ist mein Buch vor ein paar Wochen erschienen. Ich habe vom Verlag 3 Exemplare gekriegt, möchte aber noch 3 haben, da ich es noch einigen Leuten schenken soll. Würdest Du nun die Güte haben und mir 3 Exemplare kaufen und schicken? Das Geld dafür werde ich Dir dann schicken, aber vielleicht nicht auf einmal, sondern ratenweise, wenn ich nur erst weiß, wie ich es machen kann. Zu Weihnachten werde ich mich in Wien darüber erkundigen. Natürlich gilt meine Bitte nur für den Fall, daß Dir die Auslage GAR KEINE Schwierigkeiten macht; denn die Angelegenheit ist ja nicht *sehr* wichtig. Im Falle, daß Du die Bücher besorgen kannst, wäre es mir am liebsten Du tätest es recht bald!—Ich bin jetzt in einem anderen Nest, wo es freilich auch nicht besser ist als in dem Vorigen. Es ist schwer mit den Menschen zu leben! Aber es sind ja eigentlich gar keine Menschen sondern $\frac{1}{4}$ Tiere und $\frac{3}{4}$ Menschen.

Schreib mir bald; auch wie es Dir geht.

Grüße Deine liebe Frau herzlich von mir.

Dein treuer
LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN

Meine Adresse ist:
L.W. bei Frau Ehrbar
Puchberg am Schneeberg
Nieder-österreich

[Translation:
DEAR RUSSELL,

It is a long time since I have heard from you or written to you and today I am writing chiefly because I have a favour to ask of you: I want (as we say here) "to put the bite on you". As you know my book appeared a few weeks ago. I have had 3 copies from the publisher, but should like another 3 copies because there are more people whom I need to present copies to. Would you very kindly buy three copies and send them to me? The money for them I will send you later, probably not all at once, but in instalments, as soon as I know how I can manage it. I will find out about that in Vienna at Christmas. Obviously the request only holds good as long as the outlay does not cause you any difficulties AT ALL, because the matter is not *very* important. If you really can get me the books, the best thing for me would be if you could do it straight-away!—I am now in another hole, though, I have to say, it is no better than the old one. Living with human beings is hard! Only they are not really human, but rather $\frac{1}{4}$ animal and $\frac{3}{4}$ human.

Do write soon, also to tell me how things are with you.

Give my very best wishes to your wife.

Yours ever
LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN

My address is:
L.W. c/o Frau Ehrbar
Puchberg am Schneeberg
Lower Austria]

vor ein paar Wochen erschienen/appeared a few weeks ago. – The book was published by Kegan Paul in November. The letter, which is undated, must be from November or December 1922.

27. *LW to BR*

7.4.23
Puchberg am Schneeberg, N.ö.

LIEBER RUSSELL!

Ich habe lange nichts mehr von Dir gehört und auch nicht geschrieben weil

es wenig neues gibt und auch weil ich etwas krank war. Meine Nerven sind durch die Arbeit und viele Aufregung recht herunter gekommen und oft fürchte ich, daß sie es nicht bis zu den Ferien aushalten werden.—Vor kurzer Zeit erhielt' ich "The Meaning of Meaning". Gewiß ist es auch Dir geschickt worden. Ist das nicht ein miserables Buch?! Nein, so leicht ist die Philosophie doch nicht! Dafür sieht man aber, wie leicht es ist, ein dickes Buch zu schreiben. Das ärgste ist die Einleitung des Professor Postgate Litt.D. F.B.A. etc. etc.. Etwas so albernes habe ich selten gelesen.—Ein wenig neugierig bin ich auf Ritchies Buch, das er mir schicken will (wie mir Ogden schreibt). Ritchie war ein netter Mensch und ich würde mich freuen von ihm zu hören.

Schreib auch Du wieder einmal, wie es Euch allen geht und was Dein kleiner Bub macht; ob er schon fleißig Logik studiert. Sei herzlich begrüßt und grüße auch Deine liebe Frau

von Deinem
LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN

[Translation:

DEAR RUSSELL,

I have not heard anything more from you for a long time and I have also not written, because there was little that was new and also because I have been rather unwell. The work and all the excitement have got my nerves completely down and I am often afraid that I shall not be able to hold out until the holidays.—

A short time ago I received *The Meaning of Meaning*. Doubtless it has been sent to you too. Is it not a miserable book?! No, no, philosophy, after all, is not as easy as that! But it does show how easy it is to write a thick book. The worst thing is the Introduction by Professor Postgate, Litt.D., F.B.A., etc. etc. I have rarely read anything so stupid.—

I am a bit curious about Ritchie's book, which he means to send me (so Ogden writes). Ritchie was a nice person and I should be happy to hear from him.

Now it is for you to write me another letter telling me how things are going for you and yours and what your little boy is doing. Is he already a keen student of logic? Warmest greetings to you with messages also to your wife,

Yours
LUDWIG WITTGENSTEIN]

"*The Meaning of Meaning*". — By C.K. Ogden and I.A. Richards.

Ritchie. — A.D. Ritchie (1892–1967), physiologist and philosopher, then Fellow of Trinity College, Cambridge, later Professor of Logic and Metaphysics at Edinburgh. The book referred to is evidently *Scientific Method*, published by Kegan Paul in the same series as the *Tractatus* and *The Meaning of Meaning*.